| **Student Name:** Yu Bo Peng |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the increasingly sympathetic portrayal of villains in pop culture (e.g. Joker, Maleficent, Thanos, etc) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  The problem statement needs to be clearer in the opening. What is the single biggest issue with this kind of portrayal?  Set-up   * What does it mean for children to be ‘impacted less wrongly’. * Clear on how your side prefers more clearly delivered moral lessons - that there is a black and white depiction.   Argument 1   * What is the thesis of this argument? * You need to start by explaining how sympathetic portrayal muddles reality in the way you claim. Then, explain how your side solves this problem - and then impact. * What future, what experience? Are you proving this impact materialises? * Our language is super vague and non-specific, which leads to the POI Verena asks you. You need to connect your benefits to the counterfactual you support, as opposed to making it sound like you think these benefits result from sympathetic depiction.   Argument 2   * What is distinct between this argument and our first one? * We didn’t argue at all that sympathetic depiction is wrong…? Where is the explanation as to why this should not happen?   We’re not making any eye contact whilst we speak. We’re also not really using hand gestures. You need to focus on your presentation! Remember, you’re trying to convince me you are correct. Make more eye contact, use hand gestures, read less!  04:21  You have to ask POIs diligently! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Jay Lam |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the increasingly sympathetic portrayal of villains in pop culture (e.g. Joker, Maleficent, Thanos, etc) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Explain why this kind of backstory is necessary or important. Give me the strongest reason up top! For instance, is it that understanding a villain's perspective can foster empathy and encourage audiences to consider the human factors that contribute to even the most reprehensible actions?  Rebuttal   * Don’t say it makes you laugh! Explain why there is no point to black and white moral reasoning; do such characters exist in real life? * Did they talk about teamwork or leadership skills? * Engage with the actual benefits coming from the other side - point out that they never explain why black and white does this in a way that is better than status quo; they never explain what is wrong with the status quo.   Argument 1   * Why are we starting with an example? Start with your thesis. * We made the example our entire argument - focus on the LOGIC of the argument instead! * We can argue that sympathetic villains can challenge societal norms and encourage critical thinking about issues of justice, morality, and power. By presenting alternative perspectives, these portrayals can spark important conversations about the systems that create and perpetuate villainy. We can also argue that the real world rarely presents clear-cut heroes and villains. Sympathetic portrayals of villains can reflect this complexity and offer a more realistic representation of human behavior, where motivations are often mixed and actions are rarely purely good or evil. * What is the impact of this argument?   Good response to the POI.  We have to speak louder and be more confident! Even when you ask POIs, you have to SPEAK UP and ENUNCIATE properly.  05:08 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Lucas Ma |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the increasingly sympathetic portrayal of villains in pop culture (e.g. Joker, Maleficent, Thanos, etc) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  We OPPOSE sympathetic depiction. Why are we saying there is a good reason for them to be bad? You have to watch your phrasing.  Did we respond to any of the material coming from Jay?   * Did we engage with the idea of backstories and justified evil actions? * Did we rebuild against any of the responses to our first speakers case?   Argument 1   * Start by explaining why children are fundamentally unable to understand and why their parents or teachers explaining this is not possible? This argument isn’t engaging with any of the material that came in the speech before you. * You need to start by explaining how sympathetic portrayal muddles reality in the way you claim. Then, explain how your side solves this problem - and then impact. * Our language is super vague and non-specific. You need to connect your benefits to the counterfactual you support, as opposed to making it sound like you think these benefits result from sympathetic depiction.   POI: Why do they think this way? How do they go from watching television to thinking and behaving in this way?  What is the structure of this speech? We jump from rebuttal to our argument to rebuttal again?  Finish your sentences - don’t just end in ‘and yeah’.  04:39  You have to ask POIs diligently! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Verena Wong |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the increasingly sympathetic portrayal of villains in pop culture (e.g. Joker, Maleficent, Thanos, etc) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Verena, what is this observational opening achieving? I’ve written this in your feedback sheet before - start with a rebuttal or an observation as to what the biggest issue in the round is, for instance the lack of explanation from Prop as to why children are unable to understand a more nuanced or sympathetic depiction. Resolve this, and then move on into your signposting.  Rebuttal   * Excellent on how there are no clearly evil villains in daily life. We can also argue that the real world rarely presents clear-cut heroes and villains. Sympathetic portrayals of villains can reflect this complexity and offer a more realistic representation of human behavior, where motivations are often mixed and actions are rarely purely good or evil. * Don’t make it about superpowers, make it about people who are 100% evil - do such people really exist? What kind of moral lessons should kids be learning or engaging with? * Engage with the biggest things they said! Did we fully rebut the biggest parts of their case? Engage with the actual benefits coming from the other side - point out that they never explain why black and white does this in a way that is better than the status quo; they never explain what is wrong with the status quo.   Argument 1   * Good on backstory. Explain why this kind of backstory is necessary or important. For instance, is it that understanding a villain's perspective can foster empathy and encourage audiences to consider the human factors that contribute to even the most reprehensible actions?   POI - We can argue that sympathetic villains can challenge societal norms and encourage critical thinking about issues of justice, morality, and power. By presenting alternative perspectives, these portrayals can spark important conversations about the systems that create and perpetuate villainy.   * What is the unique impact of this argument?   We need to make sure our debate speech sounds like a speech - loosen up and speak conversationally!  04:58 | | | | | | |